

Reciprocal Mentoring



What does the research say?

What do we do/what do we think?



### **Mentoring**



### What does the research say?

- Mixed reviews: No evidence mentoring works.
  - One to one mentoring works. (UKRI/AdvanceHE)
  - But only if mentees chose their own mentors.
  - Face to face works best.
- The outcomes that can be improved through this model are:
  - improved retention &
  - satisfaction levels,
  - improved work performance &
  - o academic performance,
  - increased visibility of the mentee.



(MacPhee et al. 2013, Viets et al. 2009, Wingard et al. 2008.)



### What does the research say?

Reverse mentoring *can* be an intervention for finding out what is going on with other generations and/or culture groups in order to address critical organisational issues or policymaking.

(Harvey et al. 2009).

A reverse mentoring relationship *can* become not only an unusual connection out of the formal hierarchy, but also allows the creativity to be reignited in the most senior levels.

Reverse mentoring is *perceived* to be beneficial for bridging the generational gap around technology and computer skills.

(Meister and Willyerd 2010, Allen and Rhoton 2003, Baily 2009).

(Walton, Training Journal, April 2019 'Lifting the lid on creativity')



#### Some examples

The Collaborative Knowledge Exchange for Learning Impact (Crannóg) is a partnership between Higher Education Institutions in Ireland which provides support and opportunities of professional development of those colleagues in roles such as Head of School/Department, Dean, etc. Specifically, the project focuses on aspects of leadership of teaching & learning, using student mentors.

A full resource pack is available here (<a href="https://www.jisc.ac.uk/guides/developing-successful-student-staff-partnerships/viewpoints">https://www.jisc.ac.uk/guides/developing-successful-student-staff-partnerships/viewpoints</a>).



#### Some examples

Wharton Fellows: Master Classes and Networking for Senior Executives was another reverse mentoring (upward mentoring, reciprocal mentoring) was introduced in US for providing opportunities to learn from and dialogue between educational organizations and industries that are successfully navigating business environment.

(Zanni 2009, Myers and Sadaghiani 2010, Peterson 2012, Tayşır and Ülgen 2017).







#### Some examples

Reverse mentoring programmes also appear in studies where glass-ceiling effects have been investigated in relation to representation and progression of women as underrepresented

groups.



(Mattis 2001, de Vries 2011). (Giscombe 2007).





#### My own experience

Reciprocal Mentoring



EPSRC – too early to tell <a href="https://northernpowerinclusion.org/">https://northernpowerinclusion.org/</a> East Riding – senior leaders and students. Mixed review depending on individuals involved - matches general research conclusions:

- Senior level participants need to be willing to try something new, think differently, learn from those further down the hierarchy.
- Organisationally, it needs to be sponsored from the top, with permission to fail.



#### Key research findings

- 1. No full scale systematic reviews evaluating reverse mentoring.
- 2. Some qualitative work indicate that it is feasible if tailored according to the target.
- 3. Some evidence suggest promising effects on progression of women in leadership roles.
- 4. There is currently no evidence on effects in organisational cultural change.
  - For knowing the evidence on actual change in the organisational culture the data needs to be collected longitudinally.



#### Personal Insights??? - Questions

- 1. Political and cultural who decides what it is called? And how it is communicated?
- 2. Collusion or challenge who is involved? only those who wish to be involved, or those who need to be involved?
- 3. Matching who sets this up? How is this done? The criteria?
- 4. Impact and evaluation new ways of thinking, behaving? How do we know sustainable if not part of performance management / review? Who connects project findings to HR / organisational processes / cultural change?



#### What do you think?

Discussion / sharing activity - One:

- 1a. Have you already made use of reverse mentoring? If so, in what context? Did it work well? Did it not?
- 1b. If not used, how might you make use of reverse mentoring in the future?
- 2a. What benefits have you saw, if used?
- 2b. What possible benefits would you expect, if not yet used?
- 3a. How are you measuring the impact, and at what level, if being used?
- 3b. How might you evaluate the impact of reverse mentoring, if used in future?



#### What do you think?

Discussion / sharing activity - Two:

Key points we often steer clear of:

- 1. How do you engage senior leaders who don't think they need (reverse) mentoring?
- 2. How do you engage senior leaders in learning and development in general who have stopped believing they need any?
- 3. How do you impact on changing cultures when the senior team believe the current culture is fine? (or, have no considerations around culture at all?)



Baily, C. (2009). Reverse intergenerational learning: a missed opportunity?. Ai & Society, 23(1), 111-115.

de Vries, J. (2011). Mentoring for change. UAEW. Available at: http://www.womeninscienceresearch.org.au/docs/deVriesUAEWmentoringforchangereport.pdf

Finkelstein, L.M., Allen, T.D. and Rhoton, L.A. 2003. An Examination of the Role of Age in Mentoring Relationships. Groups & Organizational Management, 28: 249–281.

Harvey, M., McIntyre, N., Thompson Heames, J., & Moeller, M. (2009). Mentoring global female managers in the global marketplace: traditional, reverse, and reciprocal mentoring. The International Journal of Human Resource Management, 20(6), 1344-1361.

MacPhee, D., Farro, S., & Canetto, S. S. (2013). Academic self-efficacy and performance of underrepresented STEM majors: Gender, ethnic, and social class patterns. Analyses of Social Issues and Public Policy, 13(1), 347-369.

Mattis, M. C. (2001). Advancing women in business organizations: Key leadership roles and behaviors of senior leaders and middle managers. *Journal of Management Development*, 20(4), 371-388.

Myers, K., & Sadaghiani, K. (2010). Millennials in the workplace: A communication perspective on millennials' organizational relationships and performance. Journal of Business and Psychology, 25, 225–238. doi:10.1007/s10869-010-9172-7.



Peterson, M. J. (2012). Switching roles: an investigation into the use of reverse-mentoring by students to encourage teachers' uptake of ICT in their pedagogical approach(Doctoral dissertation, Curtin University).

Tayşır, N. K., & Ülgen, B. (2017). "Reverse Mentoring" Designs of Banking Sector in Turkey. *Çanakkale Onsekiz Mart Üniversitesi Yöneti* 

Viets VL, Baca C, Verney SP, Venner K, Parker T, Wallerstein N. Reducing health disparities through a culturally centered mentorship program for minority faculty: The Southwest Addictions Research Group (SARG) experience. Acad Med. 2009;84:1118–1126.

Wingard, D. L., Reznik, V. M., & Daley, S. P. (2008). Career experiences and perceptions of underrepresented minority medical school faculty. Journal of the National Medical Association, 100(9), 1084-1088.

Zanni, G. R. (2009). Reverse mentoring: an effective strategy for career growth. The Consultant pharmacist: the journal of the American Society of Consultant Pharmacists, 24(6), 465-467.

Zauschner-Studnicka, S. (2017). A model for reverse-mentoring in education. International Journal of Social, Behavioral, Educational, Economic, Business and Industrial Engineering, 11(3), 546-553.

